

How Does the Community of Students Interpret Statements and Attitudes of Teachers Considering the Hidden Curriculum: A Qualitative Study

Jehan G. Al-Bloshi , Ibrahim A. El-Shara 

Department of Curriculum and Instruction, School of Educational Sciences, The University of Jordan, Amman, Jordan.

Received: 30/3/2022
Revised: 27/9/2022
Accepted: 22/11/2022
Published: 30/10/2023

* Corresponding author:
ibrahim.alshara@gmail.com

Citation: Al-Bloshi, J. G. ., & El-Shara, I. A. . (2023). How Does the Community of Students Interpret Statements and Attitudes of Teachers Considering the Hidden Curriculum: A Qualitative Study. *Dirasat: Human and Social Sciences*, 50(5), 613–627.
<https://doi.org/10.35516/hum.v50i5.946>



© 2023 DSR Publishers/ The University of Jordan.

This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY-NC) license
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Abstract

Objectives: This study aimed at identifying the content of implicit messages conveyed by female teachers to their female students.

Methods: The ethnographic qualitative approach was used to achieve the goals of the study. Fifteen audio recorded class sessions of four teachers teaching the 9th or 10th grades at a certain public school were observed. The four teachers and six students of the observed teachers were also interviewed. The validity and reliability of the obtained data were verified.

Results: The study showed several implicit messages conveyed by teachers to their students, such as respect of law, care for cleanliness, and respect of points of view of others. Some other hidden messages are negative; being not so strict about their attendance of classes, when they do not commit themselves to the time of a class, and when they underline certain subjects in the curriculum as being more important than others. The students interpret these messages in two directions, one of them the desire of the female teachers to win the students' approval and affection and to draw the students closer to them, on the other hand female teachers' desire to impose their control over the students, and to warn the students that the power and decision returns to the teacher.

Conclusions: The teacher's clear message, student reception, and understanding is vital for successful teaching. Differences in message interpretation affect student interaction and acceptance. Teachers must be mindful of implicit meanings and students' interpretations to maintain clear communication and participation.

Keywords: Content of messages, hidden curriculum, basic education, qualitative study.

كيف يفسر مجتمع الطلبة أقوال المعلمين وممارساتهم في ضوء المنهاج الخفي: دراسة نوعية

جهان بلوشي، إبراهيم الشرع*

قسم المناهج والتدريس، كلية العلوم التربوية، الجامعة الأردنية، عمان، الأردن

ملخص

الأهداف: هدفت هذه الدراسة إلى تعرف مضامين الرسائل التي تنقلها المعلمات إلى طالباتهن. **المنهجية:** استخدم المنهج النوعي الإثنوغرافي، شوهدت خمس عشرة حصة سجلت تسجيلاً مرئياً لأربع معلمات يدرسن الصف التاسع أو العاشر الأساسي في إحدى المدارس الحكومية وتمت مقابلة ست طالبات عند المعلمات اللواتي شوهدت حصصهن، وجرى التحقق من مصداقية البيانات وموثوقيتها.

النتائج: أظهرت النتائج وجود العديد من الرسائل الضمنية التي تنقلها المعلمات لطالباتهن بعضها إيجابية: كاحترام القوانين، والحرص على النظافة، وتقبل الرأي الآخر؛ وبعضها سلبية: كعدم تشديد بعض المعلمات على الغياب عن حضور الحصص، وتهاون بعض المعلمات بالالتزام بوقت الحصة، والإشارة إلى أهمية بعض الموضوعات أكثر من غيرها. تفسر الطالبات هذه الرسائل في اتجاهين، رغبة المعلمات بكسب رضى الطالبات لتوطيد علاقاتهن بطالباتهن ومودتهن وتقربهن منهن، في المقابل رغبة المعلمات فرض سيطرتهن على الطالبات، وتنبيه الطالبات بأن القوة والقرار بيد المعلمة.

الخلاصة: إن وضوح الرسالة التي ينقلها المعلم للطلاب، وكيفية تلقي الطلاب لها وتحليل محتواها، أمر بالغ الأهمية لنجاح التدريس، لأن اختلاف معنى الرسالة بينهم يؤثر في قبول الطلبة للتفاعل. لذلك ينبغي أن يكون المعلم على وعي بكل المعاني الضمنية الواردة في الرسالة، وأن يدرك تفسيراتها لدى الطلبة، لإيصال المعنى المقصود دون تشويش، حفاظاً على مشاركة الطالب الكلمات الدالة: مضامين الرسائل، المنهاج الخفي، المرحلة الأساسية، دراسة نوعية.

1. Introduction

All educational authorities seek to achieve the goals of communities, through employing curriculum as the tool to achieve such goals in a way that directs the young generation towards values of the community, enhances their beliefs towards it, and develops their life practices. The curriculum is considered a critical factor when thinking about sustainable development: where teaching systems seeks to prepare students to be active in their communities by providing them with problem solving skills (Abu Warda, 2018)

School curriculum occurs in three interwoven forms: the formal curriculum which is designed previously by education authorities, the actual curriculum which is practiced in real teaching settings to achieve goals of the formal curriculum, and the hidden curriculum which represents the unexpected outcomes as a result of how the unplanned teaching practices were executed (Wafra, 2010, Berno, 2010).

A hidden curriculum is an unwritten form of a lesson, conveyed through teachers-students social relations and between students themselves as part of the learning-teaching environment (Doja, Bould, Clarkin, Eady, Sutherland & Writer, 2016), students are unintentionally and informally taught values of teachers and school staff (Cotton, Winter, and Bailey, 2013), which made educational experts name it the black box of the teaching process, where teachers have to comprehend and explore its secrets and dedicate results for the benefit of teaching because students life is too complicated to be realized by the educational systems analyzers (Ebadi, 2013, Berno, 2010, Yousefzadeh, 2014).

Real practices might contradict with targets of the formal curriculum, which results in discrepancies between what is being said and what is done, which might lead to unaccepted attitudes by students due to this contradiction (Liao, Thomas & Bell, 2014), and makes the revelation of such implied message of great importance.

Schools provide students with social skills through interacting with peers and teachers (Hashemi, Fallahi, Aojinejad and Samavi, 2012). Basic education is considered essential in the development of a student's character and includes all effective social and cultural features that affect students' attitudes (Cubukcu, 2012).

The experiences that students gain through interacting with various cultures at school or social environments are considered hidden curriculum (Nabhan, 2010). The messages of hidden curriculum are conveyed through daily conversations and practices, which makes them of great effect on students and their practices (Liao, Thomas & Bell, 2014). A hidden curriculum is unintentional teaching through the context of the common culture in the teaching environment, and informal teaching that raises voluntary results in the school system (Hashemi, et al, 2012, Berno, 2010).

The hidden curriculum is found in all school activities, through undeclared functions of the formal curriculum. What happens in the school life problems and relations, inside and outside the classroom is a hidden facade to important, yet concrete educational activities (school queues, ceremonies, sports activities, and school trips) and some might contradict deeply with its clear goals (Wafra, 2010).

According to Sambell and McDowell (1998), the hidden curriculum consists of a wide range of concepts that explain the hidden experiences that form the learning interactions occurring between informal hidden curriculum and formal teaching. Thus, we are not able to separate the hidden curriculum into clear, divided elements, because it is connected with values and practices of the formal curriculum (Cubukcu, 2012). Despite the variations in the identifications of the hidden curriculum and the different perspectives of researchers, yet, they all agree upon its effect on students' beliefs, attitudes, and perspectives (Abu Wards. 2018). The hidden curriculum has many titles but they all agree in content and meaning (Al-Hashemi, 2011).

Honoring the curriculum leads to suggest that those who write curriculum have a solution to every occurred problem in education (Posner, 2003). Still, several hidden factors affect students' thinking and the way they interact with others. Teachers' perspectives and the ideology of curriculum specialists have a bigger influence than the formal curriculum (Hashemi, et al, 2012).

Resources of the hidden curriculum vary enormously, it could be said that resources are in the whole society: homes, media, various elements of formal curriculum, teachers' practices and their relations and interactions with students, interactions of students with their peers, administration processes and the nature of the relationship between the head

principal and teachers, the arrangement of school buildings, classrooms and other school facilities of services and labs, type and arrangement of furniture, distribution of lesson schedules, kind of knowledge offered to students and how is it offered, what are the omitted information, the type of relation between the educational institution and community, school uniform, in addition to school regulations and rules (Al-ashqar.2009, Al-Khatib, 2010, Al-Bassiouni, 2012).

Teachers remain the main source of the hidden curriculum, with the most powerful effect on students' attitudes and interactions, through the teacher's practices in the classroom and outside, in the schools and outside, too. Some students may go to the extent of absorbing the teacher's character and they align with their teacher's attitudes, habits or values in their overall behavior (Karimi, Ashktorab, Mohammadi, Abedi, and Zarea, 2015, Alsubaie, 2015).

Teachers are responsible for verifying the curriculum in practice which offers the hidden curriculum more value and effect in directing students according to the teacher's status of respect, value and trust (Al-Khatib, 2010). Teachers might include what they want their students to gain through the formal curriculum, but otherwise, if the teacher wishes for his perspectives to dominate, this will harm students' capabilities (Yousefzadeh, 2014).

Features of hidden curriculum differ with the change of place, time and individuals, even the student could be a critical factor in the appearance of hidden curriculum (Al-Ahmadi, 2015, Al-Qusayr, 2012). Culture of a student is one of the basic contents of the hidden curriculum, even though schools try to control the student's daily life that is in alignment with its ideology and future vision without leaving any details to serve a more holistic vision, yet, each student has a unique answer for the question: why do I come to school? (Al-Qusayr, 2012). Students absorb values, rules and thinking norms from their teachers, by observing teachers' attitudes and practices, then analyzing and processing them in their heads and molding their learning. Thus, teachers ought to provide an open atmosphere where students enjoy the freedom and independence that enables them to participate actively in their social environment (Nyami, 2018)

Importance of the research:

The importance of the current research refers to its theoretical and applicable aspects: theoretically, this study helps to explore the underlying messages sent by teachers to their students through the hidden curriculum, where the formal curriculum has been largely cared for through planning, practicing and evaluating. Another factor of importance of the current research is the age group sample of students (adolescents), an age where some critical concepts are being formed. As for the practical aspect, the current research might participate in the students' and teachers' understanding of the features of hidden curriculum, making them aware of its value and meaning of teaching practices, and observe what happens in real settings. Results of the current study might also benefit to introduce what happens in the field to those responsible of the planning of curriculum and establishing teaching policies. It might also attract attention of teachers' trainers to what really happens in the field through the hidden curriculum in order to avoid any challenges that might restrict achieving teaching targets. This study also provides researchers with some of the literature on hidden curriculum.

Purpose of the research:

the current research seeks to highlight the content of messages conveyed by teacher to their students, and how students are affected by them.

- Reveal perspectives of students at basic level concerning the content of messages conveyed by their teachers
- Highlight the content of hidden messages conveyed by teachers and what effects do they have on students.
- Explore the consistency between the planned formal curriculum and the actual teaching settings at schools.

Idioms of the study:

The hidden curriculum: they are a set of values, norms and beliefs that a student systemically learns, but not to be found in the formal curriculum (Apple, 1990). This study defines it as the practices students have in their interactive relations with their peers, teachers and administration staff at school through the different school activities, and their perspectives about it and what students learn through observing and copying their teachers.

1.1 The Statements of the study

Improper behaviour, confused thoughts and being unable to follow some moral values are things learned through the hidden curriculum (Hamad, 2017). Hidden curriculum plays a positive role when confronting with problems of adolescence,

because students spend a lot of their time at school and they learn a lot from the unwritten, and unintentionally hidden curriculum conveyed to them through the whole interactive school environment, no matter how much effort a teacher gives in the formal developed curriculum. Students find themselves with an unspoken curriculum, yet with a strong impact on their social life (Abu Warda, 2018, Hashemi, et al, 2012).

it is of great necessity to point to this kind of curriculum because of the different negative effects and challenges of globalization, in addition to the need to promote civic, safety and health education (Al-Ahmadi, 2015)

The mid-twenty-first century witnessed practices of individuals that were deviated from the norms of themselves and their communities (Nyamai, 2018, Cubukcu, 2012). Educators wonder: who is responsible for the forming of perspectives, attitudes and practices? What is its origin? Despite the fact that it is hard to control and employ hidden curriculum positively, partly due to the enormous contradicting intellectual currents which might form some negative perspectives that deviate students away from educational objectives as a result of the hidden curriculum. As we said, different studies revealed the value of hidden curriculum and its effects on students (Abu Warda, 2018, Nyami, 2018, Al-Bassam and Al-Bakr, 2015, Al-ghamdi, Al-Mulhem & Khanfar, 2018), and confirmed that sometimes, what is learned through the hidden curriculum is more reliable and durable than what is learned through formal curriculum (Ebadi, 2013).

Studying hidden curriculum diverts our attention from declared educational objectives towards learning results as informed by teachers' experiences (Berno, 2010, Watfa, 2010). And studying the impact of hidden curriculum on students is a necessity to understand and explain the nature of implicit messages conveyed to students, thus, the current study was conducted to answer the following question:

What is the content of messages conveyed by basic education female teachers to their students within hidden curriculum?

previous studies

Some previous and pedagogical studies concerning the hidden curriculum were reviewed. Some of which dealt with the hidden curriculum in the Jordanian environment: the study of (Watfa, 2010) is considered to be a serious investigation to reveal the ideological variables of the education messages in the teaching institutions, the study followed the critical approach to separate hidden curriculum from applied education curriculum using ideological indicators. The study revealed the influential role of the hidden curriculum and ideological social level, which presented a great variation of knowledge and skills between students according to their different social backgrounds. Whereas, the study of (Abu-Dabat, 2012) aimed to explore the extent to which teachers of basic school are competent and aware of the basic aspects of the hidden curriculum, the study was applied on 20 male and female teachers of basic level in four (public and private) schools in Jordan. Results showed that teachers at this level were aware of the aspects of the hidden curriculum, the study also revealed no statistical variables between teachers of public or private schools in the pedagogical factors.

Hamad (2017) conducted a study that aimed at pointing out the role of the hidden curriculum in promoting values of ethical responsibility, and exploring the disadvantages and risks of the hidden curriculum, and explaining the specifications of ethical responsibility. Results of the study showed that the most powerful resource of the hidden curriculum are the teacher's beliefs, norms and values, the nature of social relation within the educational institutions, homes environments, the effect of different media. Results imply the need to bridge the gap between the hidden and the formal curriculum through the careful planning and evaluation of the hidden curriculum and to observe its outcomes.

The study of (Andarvarazhi, et al, 2018) seeks to introduce a clear identification of the hidden curriculum. Researchers used keywords in the database of (587) articles. Then, the study was restricted to (55) articles connected to the issue of study, after analyzing the different identifications of the hidden curriculum it was agreed upon the identification of the hidden curriculum as a strong, hidden not planned approach transformed through human factors and lays basically in the cultural and systematic scale of the education environment. The messages conveyed by the hidden curriculum might contradict and it has its positive effect or negative ones in forming beliefs, attitudes and experiences of students.

2. Method and procedure

The qualitative, ethnographic approach is considered the most effective to reveal all that concerns hidden curriculum (Karimi, et al., 2015). Several studies confirm that qualitative studies are more suitable than the quantitative approach when studying hidden curriculum, due to the fact that features of hidden curriculum are gained in its own context, and each educational institution has its unique components that can be obtained by observing its own individuals, resources and functions (Cotton, et al., 2013). The qualitative approach provides a deep understanding of the content of teachers' messages, and the ethnographic studies provide real images of the unseen phenomena through the observation of spoken and non-spoken interactions in the classroom environment (Mossop, Hammond and Dennick, 2013).

2.1 Participants and context

We selected intentionally one of the girls' public schools that includes 9th and 10th grades, with a population of (238) girls. To observe students' interactive relations in the classroom and at the school environment for the school year 2019/2020, students were observed during classes and outside classrooms, in the schools' halls during different activities and in the morning assembly. Formal approval of (4) teachers was arranged upon observing their classes and interviewing them afterward, and (6) students of the (4) teachers agreed to be interviewed, (3) of them were in ninth grade and the other (3) were in tenth grade. Teachers and students of the study were given free will to withdraw at any time they wish to, either in the observation time or the interview, no contradiction in benefits was recorded.

the school was intentionally selected for the following reasons: The school's director was cooperative in facilitating the processes required for the research, Teachers selected for the sample of the study showed cooperation and willingness to receive the researcher in their classes (to observe interactive processes) and the availability of the sample of selected classes (ninth and tenth grades)

2.2 Data collecting

2.2.1 Direct observation

Observation is an ideal instrument to reveal real situations of the hidden curriculum because studying hidden curriculum needs to explore beyond the unseen, searching for meanings and contexts (Cotton, et al, 2013). Participants were observed intensively through the whole school day: In the learning-teaching settings, norms of relationships with peers and teachers, in school's halls and principal's room, during break and shift times in order to monitor all forms of social interactions. Notes were taken in the spoken language in order not to be explained otherwise.

The two researchers adopted a notecard of performance indicators, distributed on the fields of the curriculum: the school's organizational structure, the school's social environment and social interactions.

Data were recorded and analyzed gradually in the different stages of data collecting to find relations between the variants and to arrange them in a general framework and concepts that can be processed. Observations were made through a whole semester of the school year 2019/2020, each day of observation started with the morning assembly. Joining teachers in their room and attending their classes. The classes were not recorded in the first week in order to strengthen the student-teacher relationship and get them acquainted with our presence so as to act normally.

Semi-structured interviews: The basic goal of interviews was to understand the various aspects of the individual's implicit life and acknowledge their perspectives, and deepen our understanding of a phenomenon as the participant sees and expresses it (Cengel & Turkoglu, 2016). The study is concerned with understanding students' perspectives about the content of messages conveyed by their teachers. Therefore, it is important to collect detailed data about their school lives and about their teachers. Researchers used the tool of an interview to explore the content of messages through observing social relations and interactions between all individuals of the school environment: students, teachers, staff and administration.

2.2.2. Teachers' interviews

the Structured interview is to understand the variables of the individuals' hidden lives and to find out their attitudes that are hard to know only through observation (Cengel & Turkoglu, 2016). Also, because the aim of this study is to deepen the understanding of students to the content of messages conveyed by their teachers, it is of great value to gather details about

student school life and their teachers. Thus, the researcher used the semi-structured open questions to discover meaning of interactive, social relations and its implications between students and their teachers, and between students themselves, and between students and administrative staff at school.

A quasi questionnaire was formed which contained a number of open-ended questions that cover different aspects of the hidden curriculum and explored the content of the implicit messages conveyed from teachers to their students. The questionnaire contained 5 probing questions that lead the researchers to deeply explore the participants in order to reach the meanings of the implicit messages conveyed to students, also, to help discover the content of those messages.

A committee of school staff worked as an arbitrary team to review questions of the interview and provide their remarks and suggestions. According to (Berno, 2010) teachers are aware of the undeclared shaping experiences in school programs, yet, they are not fully informed of all the experiences a student might gain at school. Ninth and tenth grade teachers were interviewed through cell phone audio recording. Each interview took (30-35) minutes and they were held at different times, then the words were transcribed as said without any change or interpretation directly on the day of the interview. Then the interview was being read more than once, decoded and analyzed and reanalyzed to reach all possible themes.

2.2.3 Students' interviews

Students' interviews and analyzing their stories is a valuable indicator of how hidden curriculum affects their lives and molds their characters (Mossop, et al., 2013). Questions were set after a deep review of the pedagogic literature and that of similar studies concerned with the hidden curriculum. (11) Open-end, probing questions were drafted to figure out the meaning and content of messages conveyed by teachers. Questions were set to include real experiences of girl students as a result of their interactions in the cultural and social school environment, and questions try to reveal what was unnoticed during the school day.

Individual interviews were made with (6) students from the ninth and tenth grades, (3) students from each grade after ending class observation. Each interview lasted (20-30) minutes, students' answers were transcribed as said directly on the same day of the interview, without altering or explaining the words, students' answers were analyzed and decoded and being read several times.

Student interviews were beneficial to judge the alignment between what teachers meant in their hidden curriculum and what the students formed out of those messages. Using observation and interviews formed a structure of shared experiences about certain teacher-student and student-student events, helped in verifying the accuracy of the stories of participants, and explained some of the contradictions of the teacher's or student's story for the same situation and why participants had different perspectives in explaining events (Cotton, et al., 2013).

topics were inductively and deductively analyzed, using the inductive analyses the researcher reread the scripts to locate and form and explain the content, put them into a scale and develop the coding layouts. The colleague researcher reviewed the script independently to consider the meaning interpreted by the provided data, and after the inductive analyses, scripts were reviewed using a set of previously defined categories to examine specific content areas, these categories were based on the pedagogy of the area of hidden curriculum.

Validity and reliability

Validity was confirmed through:

2.1 Triangulation:

was verified by referring to various resources of data collecting, hearing to perspectives of different people to reach for aligned or contradicted evidence, and verifying the alignment between the purpose and content of messages conveyed to students and how they understand them. The researchers used observation to explore student practices in different school situations, to figure out the content of the messages, interviewed teachers and students to see how data aligned or contradicted.

Interviews were recorded, transcribed as said, and read many times. Then, data was encoded to reach for a certain explanation that verified or altered the category and the encoded data. It was also encoded to verify the validity of data through examining peer test and verify participants' acceptance of the interpretations.

Two approaches were used to verify reliability of data analysis: stability of analysis through time, by one of the researchers analyzing five observed classes that were randomly chosen, then reanalyzing them after two weeks, and according to the agreement coefficient between the two analyses using Cooper equations (Cooper, 1974), was found to be equal (91%). Reliability of the analyzers by referring to colleague analysis, where a colleague was trained on the instrument of analysis after analyzing an observed lesson other than the intended lesson to verify reliability with the participation of a colleague and create coherence in understanding between the researcher and the colleague, then the colleague analyzes the same class that was analyzed by the researcher, and the resulted agreement coefficient according to Cooper equation was (83%).

3. Results and discussion

Results were arranged according to three areas of the hidden curriculum: Organizational structure of the school, school environment and social interaction (Abdulsalam, 2008, Mossop, et al., 2013, Ebadi, 2013, Taamneh, 2018, yousefzadeh, 2014, Al-Masha'leh, 2019).

4.1 Content of messages conveyed to students by their teachers in the context of the organizational structure of the school

It was clear from the observed classes and girls' interviews that laws were not that clear for everyone. Knowing and understanding laws depended on how long girls have been attending school, or by reading instructions on bulletin boards while going up the stairs. When asked about school laws, the first girl answered:

"Chemistry teacher talks to us about school rules at the beginning of the school year and when we enter the classroom, it's right there in front of our face, so we have to read them; they tell us that we have to follow the rules....so that no problems occur later"

This indicates that teachers wished to convey the implicit messages of two sides, first: Encouraging girls to commit themselves to the rules and directions which empower the school's discipline and management. Second: Abiding by rules empowers the teachers' and administration's authority. Students were also encouraged to have dialogues and discussions that were based upon evidence and justifications. Certain teachers were keen to explain the rules and regulations of their classes at the beginning of the class, this might ensure that no student would violate rules and the class will run smoothly. And there will be no excuse for students pretending not to be aware of the rules, so teachers of the first-lesson repeat regulations at the beginning of each lesson.

Observations of the place where a student sat reveal a lot, those who were interested to follow what had been taught tend to sit in front rows, while the back seats were commonly occupied by the more troublesome or certain "interest groups". The teacher tried to interfere by changing the students' seats and separating groups in order to have control, for example the second teacher asked a girl to change her seat after she was noticed talking to her colleague by saying:

"Get up and sit somewhere else away from your friend"

When a girl (Sumayya) was asked about her opinion of sitting in the back, she answered:

"I don't really like sitting in the back seats, the girls there talk a lot and don't pay attention; I like to be in the middle or in the front seats so as to clearly see the teacher".

As for assessment methods, some teachers tended to send their students messages about what an exam might include, telling them in a class setting:

"This definition is important; I will bring it over in the exam and dare those who are not able to answer it"

Teachers cared about her students' achievement at an exam and they would clearly say:

"Questions might include true or false statements, but just enough so that good students won't have a lot of mistakes"

One of the teachers also clearly explained the distribution of remarks to encourage her students to clarify, justify and explain their answers, by saying:

"Each drawing in the question has a mark, when I calculate five marks for a question, one mark will be for the

drawing, 1 for the answer and 1 for the justification".

Engaging in correcting process reflected the teacher's motive to enhance students' performance, verifies equality, justice and validity of the assessment process.

We have witnessed a lot of situations where the assessment of performance was the winning card in the teacher's hand; by threatening the girls to remain quiet in order to get good marks, which seemed to be a good way to deal with discipline, because clever girls want to make up for previous results of the written exam and weak students want to raise their grades. Teachers might even have parts of the grades depending on a student being quiet, in order to control the class, one of the teachers of tenth grade once said:

"When we start grading for performance, the girls who have certain attitude in the back will behave".

Sometimes, an assessment of performance seemed like a reward, and other times as a punishment. A third teacher would ask her students:

"Do you care for a bonus, now?"

And she wrote (+1, i.e. the teacher adds one degree) on the notebooks of the students who had solved the problem. Teachers insisted on having a quiet classroom and told students that a quiet girl might make up for her academic success, which conveyed implicit messages (that being quiet equals academic success), also by this, the teacher wished to convey an implicit message of her authority over the grades as a tool to control the class and reduce disorder.

4.2 Content of messages conveyed by teachers to their students within the school social environment

It seems that teachers fostered the love of one's country and be proud of it, while a teacher was speaking about falls of the world, she started by mentioning some falls in Jordan by saying:

*"We have Rmemeen falls and Ishtafena (Tourist area) which are also as beautiful.
Our country is so beautiful".*

By this, she was informing them about the richness of their homeland, which made them prouder and more loyal. The fourth teacher also promoted national values of being proud of our Jordanian army, the love for our country and being thankful for safety and peace, by this she was conveying the message of the necessity of love for our country and our pride in the army and forces, by asking her students:

*"Why do countries of inner conflict ask for the help of our General
Security forces and Gendarmerie?. It is because of the high efficiency
of our armed forces and the excellent conduct of our soldiers."*

Teachers also encouraged cooperation between students, conveyed messages about the importance of group work to collect data, gained social experiences and decreased work pressure. One of the girls in the first teacher's class distributed (paper sheets) to the girls who didn't have them, and the teacher didn't complain about the confusion caused by the distributing of papers, one of the girls asked to have a paper from her friend and was allowed. Teachers encouraged students to share information, by saying:

*"Now you and your friend: What is the different between love and sympathy?
You have one minute to discuss the issue and write down your answer"*

Some teachers conveyed messages of respect and acceptance of others' points of view, which stated the message that one should respect the points of view of others, hear them, then accept them and never be hostile. Diversity was a blessing; for example, when a girl answered that the synonym for the word blame is hate, another girl strongly disapproved by saying:

"whaaaat?" (A condemning question that expresses refusal of the colleague's answer)

The teachers answered by saying:

"Well, it's her point of view"

In another learning situation the teacher warn students by saying:

"Can we hear each other and discuss the matter?"

Teachers were restricted over issues of commitment to personal hygiene and were keeping a clean classroom,

accordingly, the first teacher started her class by saying:

"9th graders! What is all this garbage behind the door?"

Then, one of the students got up and collects the garbage. In another class and after welcoming students, the same teacher asked a student to collect the paper thrown under her seat into the trash bin:

"May you please collect the papers underneath your seat?"

Students were influenced by those implicit messages and they collected trash into the trash bin, and when asked about their care about a clean school, the third girl answered:

"Our school is always clean...I have never seen it being dirty, even in my classroom collect any trash without being asked to, because it depends on being clean"

This answer implicated that students understood the implicit message conveyed by their teachers, that being clean was a social value to adapt to no matter where you are. Teachers were careful for students' health, thus, when a girl came to the teacher who was responsible for the health committee to complain about her suspect of having flu, the teacher asked her to sit away from her colleagues to avoid infecting them.

It was obvious that some teachers played a role model for taking care of their health, for example, the fourth teacher brought a bottle of water in each class she attends, and drank out of it during teaching, which encouraged students to drink water during classes. By this, students gained the implicit message of the importance of caring for their own health. Teachers also cared for the life of their students, once the garbage truck came to the schoolyard and the teacher asked students to move to a far location away from the truck.

4.3 Messages conveyed to students through social relations at school

Teacher-student relations were described to be full of love, kindness and respect; sometimes teachers tended to be strict and other times more tolerant: when teachers called students in a lovable, sympathetic manner; this strengthens the bond tighter and set students at ease, like when they say:

"How are you dear daughters, ma (mother) come here...mamito (i.e. Mama). My beloved girls, who is the sweetie that will answer the question? Who is the beauty that will tell me?"

Teachers also insisted on calling students with their names, and in case the teacher forgot the name, she would ask the girl in a friendly manner before hearing her answer:

"What was your name, ma?" (What is your name dear daughter?)

All this added a joyful atmosphere, and teachers didn't hesitate to show their sympathy toward the girls as the situation demands and thus, this conveyed a message that teachers' tasks were not only teaching but also connecting human relations to verify teaching objectives, the second teachers called a girl who was crying –tenth grade, at the beginning of class, and talked to her privately:

Teacher: *"come tell me what's wrong"*

Then she talked in a lowered voice with her and the girl went back to her seat and stopped crying, in another class, one of the girls asked the teacher:

"Miss, I need to tell you something"

The teacher called her to a side and listened to what she had to say. Teacher-students relationship was that of respect, even with the easy-going ones and teachers build their relations with their students on love and trust and maintain respect, the second teacher asked her students:

"Ok, am I allowed to start my class?"

In another teaching situation, a girl in the tenth grade who didn't pay attention in the class called out to the teacher: "Miss, repeat". The teacher answered:

"At your service, I will repeat"

On the other side, being tolerant teachers made the girls more responsive to help their teachers, for example when asked to help in drawings about traffic awareness for a school's initiative. The school principal assigned teachers to prepare teaching aids and bulletins on the subject of traffic awareness in a class where most of the girls didn't attend school due to

bad weather. The third teacher followed a strict method and pointed angrily to the girls of tenth grade:

"Tenth graders, what's wrong with you? Your classification will be bad for this year if you stay like this, what are you waiting for? Shall I give things to you with a spoon? If you are weak, ok, what were your highnesses doing in the holiday?"

The first girls explained the reason for having an imbalanced relationship between teachers and students, and for being sometimes strict and other times for showing more tolerance:

"It's nice for teachers to be strict on students so they will stop being trouble makers"

The second girl added:

"Both are ok, even those teachers who are strict, they know what's good for us and that's why they tend to be strict"

Some teachers tried to overlook some misbehavior of students in order to strengthen their relations, sometimes girls bring their teacher tea into the teachers' room and pour them some, after asking who liked some tea. Other times, girls were asked to enter the teachers' room to make up their hair and uniform in front of the mirror. A girl came to the teachers' room and gave the fourth teacher a hug and the teacher smiled at her.

Often a number of girls went out of the classroom before the beginning of a class, the teacher sent one of the students to call her colleagues back, thus, and under such a situation, it was normal that the fourth teacher tried to stop girls from escaping classes by asking one of the students in the ninth grade to write the name of all present students and in each class she attends, conveying the message that it was necessary to attend classes and that any student who didn't commit to this, will be punished.

The fourth teacher told a student:

"you are supposed to have the attendance notebook with you, to write the names all absentees in the first three classes, some girls went out in these classes and we don't know about them, you have to make a record, how would I know who was absent ?"

Sometimes when the teacher asked a question, girls tended to answer randomly, so the teacher interfered to ensure discipline by saying:

"Oh, Allah (God), raise your hands, miss"

In a class for the first teacher at ninth grade, and when a girl was talking to a colleague, the teacher interrupted them saying:

"Please, I will grant you time to speak, raise your hand and let us all hear what you have to say without side talking"

Teachers also tried to develop students' self-confidence, implying that they are capable of performing certain tasks and delivering information to their colleagues. The second teacher asked one of the students to explain to the others the meaning of oxidizing and encourages her by saying:

"If you could make the girls understand you will get 2 extra marks"

Afterwards, girls get encouraged so one of them says: *"Miss, let me explain it"*

Through the observation of classes, we haven't witnessed any teacher that differentiated between her students or preferred some more than the others. The third teacher asked the tenth-grade students: *"Who didn't answer any question today?"*

Students raised their hands and the teacher chose one to answer. In another teaching situation, the third teacher called upon the tenth-grade students who didn't come to her table to come over in order for her to see their work, then she continued solving a problem. By doing this, the teacher reinforced being fair and giving students equal opportunities.

Some teachers prioritized the religious aspect, for example the second teacher started her class by saying: *"We made from water every living thing"* and she mostly started her class by the basmallah (prayer) saying:

"In the Name of Allah, the All Merciful, and the ever merciful"

In another class, the teacher heard the sound of Athan (the call for prayer) from outside, so she started repeating after him saying: *"Glorify to the name of Allah"* fostering the religious side in students.

Teachers varied their teaching strategies to meet all students' different abilities- the first teacher used brain-storming strategy, to get acquainted with students' opinions and give them the chance to express themselves in several issues, like in

the issue of loving Allah and the issue of (being moderate in love and hate), first, teachers listened to what the girls had to say about their previous perspectives concerning the discussed subject, then she discussed their concepts and directed them towards what is right. Some teachers tried to avoid being strict by the book or to direct the thinking of the girls, this might convey the implicit message that what the teacher had to offer is sometimes more important than the book itself, in that, accordingly, the second teacher spoke to one of her students:

"Don't read from the book, what is the meaning of surface flow?"

It was clear that teachers accepted students' different ways of thinking, and they tried to convince them what is right, which helped students to think aloud and express their opinions no matter if they contradicted those of the teacher. This indicates that teachers fostered critical thinking and they explained the process of thinking that encouraged being wrong sometimes, the teacher's main goal was to recall data and previous experiences of students to reveal what they got, even if it proved wrong.

This conveyed the message that a teacher led them to the proper way of thinking even if they got the result. It was more important to explain the process of thinking. The fourth teacher started correcting alternative information for ninth-grade students, one of the girls thought that a gulf is the same as the sea, the teacher corrected her by saying:

"No, they are not seas, the gulf is not a sea, this is the red sea, and here is Aqaba gulf, Sweis gulf, what is a gulf? The gulf is a portion of the sea that penetrates land"

But sure, the teacher referred to the book from time to time, so when the second teacher asked one of her students to read from the book about the flow of a river and asked the girls to underline the important information by saying:

"Draw a line underneath this sentence"

This implied a message of the importance of this sentence and therefore might be included in the test. There also seemed to be a certain common understanding of the implications and movements between teachers and students. Once the second teacher raised the palm of her hand in front of the tenth graders, they will be prompt silent, and so does the first teacher with ninth graders. Other times she might knock on her table and they will be silent.

In other situations, the first teacher of ninth grade nodded her head to implicate that the answer is correct. When girls were asked if they understood the gestures, a teacher gives and her silent messages, one of the students said:

"When the girls are noisy, the teacher either frowns at them or tells them to be quiet"

A teacher corrected the students' information about her subject and assured them that being confused about the concept might affect future matters. This conveyed the message that a teacher's responsibility went beyond giving information, to make sure they understood things and that all knowledge was accumulative (they needed to understand the basis for later concepts).

The third teacher told a student who was solving a problem on the blackboard:

"I want you to delete the brackets, they will think it's a distribution, when you have a plus there's no need for brackets, only when you use the minus symbol"

Some girls wrote this notice, while others ignored it.

When asking girls about what have they learned from the school, one of them answered:

"my thinking became wider, I understand things better, the teacher enlightens you, you start to think deeper and understand more, and sometimes she gives us free time and starts advising us to respect and listen to our parents, not to mingle with people we don't know, not to mix with boys, she talks to us and hears us, you become more socialized, at the beginning you were so shy"

Such conveyed messages showed teacher's concern to make girls aware of social values and norms, prevent them to be driven towards unacceptable behaviours and to encourage communication among students. A teacher was not embarrassed to say she didn't know something implying that she is not the one and only source of knowledge, even when she got something wrong or didn't do something perfectly, she will not hesitate to clarify in order to send the message that she could be wrong, too, and there was always a chance to correct things without being shy.

For example, when the third teacher drew for a problem in math about cyclic quadrilateral, the drawing didn't seem to be accurate, so she explains:

"The drawing in your book is done with a protractor; refer to the answer, the angle is 50, so it should be acute, yet it looks obtuse, the drawing is not that perfect"

Some teachers tended to connect theory to real-life of students, to bond what is being taught, and to make them see that knowledge is part of their life and they can employ what they learnt in real-life situations, the second teacher made a resemblance of the fact that the low weight of a load of a river reached a low land to the individual reaching old age, and she acted as holding something heavy and said:

"The river is like an old man climbing a mountain while carrying something heavy, as he gets older her starts decreasing the things he carries until he reaches the point where he has nothing to carry, there where the river reaches the estuary and gets rid of all the sediments that escorted the river in the form of flood plains or delta"

It was clear that teachers conveyed positive messages for their students such as students must follow administrative instruction and abide by school laws, explain classroom rules at the beginning of class, insist on the importance of assessment and explain the correction strategy, develop positive attitudes towards cooperative work and respect for other points of view, foster the set of values like care for personal, classroom and school cleanliness, reinforce health awareness at school, ensure not being prejudiced with students, diverse teaching strategies, without commitment to the school curriculum book, which might convey the message of being responsible for one's own learning.

Rababaa (2018) points out that in the Jordanian education system, teachers still pay priority for believing in Allah and the ideal values as the basic measures to direct one behaviour and experiences. Also, teachers are well aware of the value of scientific research, and they encourage students to gain experiences, teachers also tend to vary their teaching resources and direct students towards creativity and innovation.

At the interview of the second teacher and by asking her about her role in correcting false perspectives of students, she said:

"for sure I don't just watch, I feel responsible to interfere in any situation I see, and sometimes even I try to solve problems among the girls themselves, I can't just sit and watch, as for values, I try to convince the girl where she got things wrong....we can't say it's not our business, we insist on education as a priority before teaching"

The behaviours of the teacher, and her choice of strategies that comply with students' needs, to achieve positive knowledge and emotional outcomes that affect their characters, like the use of cooperative, competitive teaching, the nature of the school environment, and the teachers' high expectations concerning their students. All this forms a woven school environment that makes students absorb values and attitudes and ways for communication (Cubukcu, 2012, Nyamai, 2018).

Teachers who are aware of the impact of hidden curriculum might invest the use of diverse and novel strategies that comply with students' capabilities, or to include what they want the students to learn in the formal curriculum-when time doesn't allow- teachers own a powerful effect on students perspectives, skills and attitudes, and they could enrich their students' life experiences to develop their characters through the hidden curriculum (Alsubaie, 2015).

Teachers sometimes convey negative messages: When a teacher ignores some improper behaviours, like when teachers don't insist on students sometimes missing their classes, and by this, they gain student's good relation; this could be due to having many classes, so teachers are keen to apply their comprehensive plan, rather than other small details like students' attendance. Some teachers text messages to students about the material included in the exam or tell them to highlight the important content by underlying sentences with a red pen in a lesson or to underline that certain content is more important by pointing out the important content in the school book.

Some teachers might even neglect attending classes on time, give the excuse of not being responsible for things that are not their task. School rules might also be an obstacle that prevents a teacher from actualizing her convictions, as when the third teacher said:

"The administration structure itself, number of classes and number of students from a challenge to any planned activity you want to perform with students"

Some teachers are not aware of the amount of how much their curriculum, books and class performance is dedicated to supporting the school's common teaching policy (Abu Ismail and Khawaldeh, 2015, Abu Wards, 2018).

Cengel & Turkoglu (2016) see that negative experiences that occur often and almost in each class are a result of teacher-

student interaction and are affected mainly by the teacher's character in addition to other factors like classroom rules and the education system as a whole.

We sensed alignment between all the observed classes, and that there was an obvious disagreement in the content of some messages that teachers noticed compared to the content of students' interviews. For example, researchers have noticed that teachers treat students equally without and preference to certain students, while the first student and when asked if she feels there is any discrimination, said:

"Yes, well, some teachers treat the students with the highest marks as if they are the best in everything, and girls with grades in 80% are treated different in conversation and participating in class, the teacher will tell you shut up I am not asking for your opinion"

Jackson (1990) thinks that students' attitudes towards the planned formal curriculum and how they interact with it could be a hidden curriculum. Each student understands a certain discipline differently than the other, which is called selective learning. Some conveyed messages are not included in the formal curricula and do not abide by scientific bases, but are parts of a hidden curriculum where students understanding of the world were affected by their understanding of themselves (Cubukcu, 2012).

Teachers and students could have different perspectives, due to the fact that each perspective deals with different positions of the case, which makes it hard to reach common ideological norms in a specific educational context, but collecting perspectives- even when different- leads to drawing an image of hidden curriculum and understanding of its consequences (Cotton, Winter and Bailey, 2013).

According to interactive theory, students are sometimes forced to abide by rules and routine instructions in order to keep a certain image that matches with the school's social structure, so students develop their own hidden strategies to avoid confrontation with the teacher, hide failure, pretend to be associated to school experiences or to adjust themselves to abide by instructions and follow rules and directions (Al-Bassam and Al-Bakr, 2015).

Each different methodology of research introduces different interpretations, research on the hidden curriculum is complex because it includes a set of intended or unintended messages that might apply to or contradict with the formal objectives of an institution (Cotton, winter and Bailey, 2013).

4. Conclusion:

Hidden curriculum conveys messages of different goals. Some of them are positive while others seem to be negative. Teachers' awareness and convictions towards the teaching process is basic either for the integration or the contradiction of hidden curriculum with the formal curriculum. The content of implicit messages conveyed by teachers to their students varies widely. Some of which support the set of values and proper attitudes towards schools and learning, while others send messages of the authority of the teacher in teaching situations. When a teacher connects having good grades to being quite, then she conveys the message that the power is in her hands and she acts upon that. When She distributes grades upon her vision and image of the situation, many students may complain about their low grades. Therefore, the teacher will be blamed for not being fair and logic since the grades are not based on a certain quantitative base. On the other hand, we find some teachers who consolidate values, cooperation and loyalty which reflect the teacher's desire to reinforce positive values and keep acceptable social norms and customs. Educational systems ought to observe education fields in order to achieve desired goals.

7. Acknowledgement

Our great thanks to Zeina Alabdallat, the editor and proofreading the study and to the Participant in the study: teachers and students.

8. Suggestions and Recommendations

- In light of results, the description, interpreting and explaining of the observations, the two researchers suggest the following:

- Hold training courses on how to invest in teaching situations to direct the student towards adopting practices that protect the school's environment, specifically for teachers' basic education.
- Hold workshops where teachers gather to discuss educational issues and how each of them is aware of the educational message implied in educational situations.
- Increase students' awareness towards a positive perspective for the teacher's values and invest in the friendly relations between the teacher and her students to develop the school's environment and the community surrounding the school.
- Encourage teachers to invest in different school activities and school radio to enhance images of national loyalty among students.
- Direct teachers to the need to reinforce students' interests in different learning resources and concentrate upon the content of the school curriculum, and develop investigation skills among students.
- Encourage teachers to delimit the content to the parts included in exams and evaluation, and stop using grades to conduct students' behaviours.

REFERENCES

- Abdulsalam, A. G. (2009). *Saudi students' perspectives on their teachers' transmission of negative messages: A hidden curriculum* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Kansas).
- Abu-Dabat, Z. (2012). Implementing Hidden Curriculum elements in the lower essential grades of primary schools throughout Jordan. *Journal of Education and Sociology*, 3(2), 8-13.
- Abu Ismail, A., & Khawaldeh, T. (2015). The Hidden Curriculum in E-learning. *The academic for social studies and Humanities- Department of Social Sciences*, (13), 12-22.
- Abu Warda, M. (2018). The Influence of a program Based on Hidden Curriculum on the Concept of Citizenship for Students in the Al-Majmaah University. *International journal of Cyber Behaviour, Psychology, and learning*, 8(4), 42-66.
- Al-Ahmadi, M. (2015). The Efficiency of a Training Program Aiming at Enabling Middle School Female Teachers to Develop, analyze and Implement Hidden Curriculum. *Taibah University Journal for Educational Sciences*, 3(10), 301-311.
- Al-Ashqar, J. (2009). The Hidden Curriculum between Authenticity and Contemporary. *An Egyptian Association of Curricula and Teaching Methods*, 2, 672-701
- Al-Bassam, A., & Al-Bakr, F. (2015). The Hidden curriculum and its relationship to the process of social normalization among primary school students in Riyadh: An Ethnographic Study. *The Arabian Gulf mission*, (137), 33-49.
- Al-Bassiouni, M. (2012). The Hidden curriculum. *The first international scientific conference, an oriental vision for the future of education in Egypt and the Arabian world according to the Contemporary Societal Changes*, 1, 85-98.
- Al-ghamdi, A., Al-Mulhem, H. & Khanfar, A. (2018) The Degree of Fulfilment of Ethical Responsibility by Arab Kids' Channels: Analysis of the Concept of the Hidden Curriculum. *Sharjah University Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 15(1), 71-107.
- Al-Hashemi, A. (2011). *Studies in Arabic and Islamic Education Curricula*. (1st ed.). Amman: Al-Warraq Foundation for Publishing and Distribution.
- Al-Khatib, A. (2010). Attitudes of male and female teachers towards the hidden curriculum and its impact on student achievement. *Education College Journal - Assiut University*, 26 (1), 2-32.
- Al-Qusayr, W. (2012). The hidden curriculum and its relationship to the moral values and the aesthetic values of the basic fourth grade in the Syrian Arab Republic. *Al-Fath Magazine*, (50), 340-356.
- Al-Masha'leh, M. (2019). *Curriculum Leadership: Strategies for Development and Implementation*. (1st ed.). Amman: Dar Al Fiker.
- Alsubaie, M. (2015). Hidden Curriculum One of Current Issue of Curriculum. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(33), 25-128
- Andarvazh, M., Afshar, L., & Yazdani, Sh. (2018). Hidden Curriculum: An Analytical Definition. *Journal of Medical Education*, 16(4), 198-207.

- Apple, M. (1990). *Ideology and curriculum*. (2nd ed.). London: Routledge
- Berno, P. (2010). Formal, Realistic and Hidden Curriculum. *Educational Visions*, 33, 91-100.
- Cengel, M., & Turkoglu, A. (2016). Analysis through Hidden Curriculum of Peer Relations in Two Different Classes with Positive and Negative Classroom Climates. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 16, 1893- 1919.
- Cotton, D., Winter, J., & Bailey, I. (2013). Researching the hidden curriculum: intentional and unintended messages. *Journal of Geography in Higher Education*, 37(2), 192-203.
- Cubukcu, Z. (2012). The Effect of Hidden Curriculum on Character Education Process of Primary School Students. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 12(2), 1526-1534.
- Doja, A., Bould, D., Clarkin, C., Eady, K., Sutherland, S., & Writer, H. (2016). The hidden and informal curriculum across the continuum of training: A cross-sectional qualitative study. *Medical Teacher*, 38, 410-418.
- Ebadi, S. (2013). Hidden Curriculum: An Apparent Challenge or an Unexplored Opportunity. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 2(3), 62-75.
- Hamad, H. (2017). The Role of the Hidden Curriculum in Promoting Ethical Responsibility. *The Journal of the Noble Qur'an University and Rooting of Sciences*, 3(5), 155-196.
- Hashemi, A., Fallahi, V., Aojinejad, A., Samavi, A. (2012). The Role of the Hidden Curriculum on Social Education of High School Students. *Journal of Life Science and Biomedicine*, 2(5), 255- 259.
- Jackson, P. (1990). *Life in classroom*. Teachers College Press New work and London.
- Karimi, Z., Ashktorab, T., Mohammadi, E., Abedi, H. and Zarea, K. (2015). Resources of learning through hidden curriculum: Iranian nursing student Perspective. *Journal of Education and Health promotion*, 4 (57), 1-8.
- Liao, J., Thomas, E., & Bell, S. (2014). Speaking Up About the Dangers Of The Hidden Curriculum. *Health Affairs*, 33(1), 168-171.
- Mossop, I., Hammond, R., & Dennick, R. (2013). Analyzing the hidden curriculum: Use of cultural web. *Medical Education*, 47, 134-143.
- Nabhan, Y. (2010). *Wrong Educational Methods and their impact on the upbringing of children*. Amman: Dar Al-Yazouri.
- Nyamai, D. (2018). Subtle Influences Shaping Students Beliefs, Thoughts, Attitudes and Behaviour. *International Journal of current Innovation in advanced Research*, 1(5), 1-12.
- Posner, G. (2003). *Analyzing the Curriculum*. (4th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education
- Rababa'a, O. (2018). The Degree of the Teacher's Role Practice in the Jordanian Education System in the Era of Knowledge Openness as seen by Educational Supervisors. *International Journal for Research in Education*, 42(3), 1-25.
- Sambell, K., & McDowell, L. (1998). The Construction of the Hidden Curriculum: messages and meaning in the assessment of student learning. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 23(4), 391-402.
- Taamneh, Q. (2018). The School's Role: Teacher and Curriculum in Disseminating a Culture of Tolerance and Combating Intolerance and Extremism. *The humanitarian Studies Sector, Journal Al-Azhar University*, 21(21), 39-88.
- Wafra, A. (2010). The implicit messages at school, an Ideological study of the Function of classism in the hidden curriculum. *Educational Journal*, 24(92), 15-78.
- Yousefzadeh, M. (2014). The Role of Elements of Hidden Curriculum in Learning Life Skills among University Students: A Case Study of the Student at Islamic Azad University Qaemshahr. *Indian Journal of Fundamental and Applied Life Sciences*, 4(4), 3403-340.